# The low-frequency spectra of nonthermal radio sources

# R. S. Roger

Dominion Radio Astrophysical Observatory, National Research Council, Penticton, B. C. Canada

# A. H. Bridle

Astronomy Group, Department of Physics, Queen's University at Kingston, Ontario, Canada

### C. H. Costain

# Dominion Radio Astrophysical Observatory, National Research Council, Penticton, B. C. Canada (Received <sup>1</sup> August 1973)

Flux densities of discrete radio sources measured with the 10-22-MHz T-arrays at the Dominion Radio Astrophysical Observatory are combined with observations from higher frequencies to construct and classify the continuum spectra of 225 sources in the range 10-2000 MHz. New or revised flux densities are given for 38 sources at 10 and 22 MHz, together with revised calibration factors for previously published flux densities at these frequencies. Scales used for other published flux densities in the range 12-178 MHz are assessed and an internally consistent set of scale revision factors is derived. The spectral properties of complete samples of extragalactic sources selected at 10, 178, and 1400 MHz are compared, using spectral indices evaluated at six frequencies. Classes of sources having unusually high- and lów-spectral indices are identified. Quasistellar sources are found to have spectralindices distributed differently from those ofradio galaxies; quasistellar sources with power-law regions of their spectra have generally higher spectral indices there than those of the galaxies. A small group of sources identified with blank fields contains some members whose spectral indices are uncharacteristic of distant radio galaxies or of quasistellar sources. There appears to be no evolutionary effect present in the spectral index-luminosity correlation for radia galaxies.

### I. INTRODUCTION

TEARLY all spectral flux-density measurements at wavelengths greater than about 3 m have been made with specialized radiotelescopes operating over a limited frequency range. Because sensitivity is usually less a problem than source confusion, the most economic means of obtaining such measurements is with extensive unfilled apertures of the X or T-array type. The measurements are limited by two factors; the knowledge of the gain of the instrument, often as a function of zenith angle and, especially at the longer wavelengths, the observing conditions imposed by scintillation, refraction, and absorption in the Earth's ionosphere. These latter effects are usually overcome by repeated observations and severe selection of the data.

The determination of radio source spectra from such measurements necessarily consists of accumulating flux densities measured with several different instruments each separately calibrated. This has the somewhat dubious advantage that systematic effects peculiar to only one set of measurements are fairly easily recognized and corrected. Errors due to random effects introduced by the instrument or the ionosphere require that any deviatory trend in a spectrum shown by a flux density at one wavelength needs confirmation by independent measurements before it is convincing.

In 1963-1965 two large T-arrays were constructed at the Dominion Radio Astrophysical Observatory for radio source and galactic background surveys at 10 MHz (Galt, Purton, and Scheuer 1967) and 22 MHz (Costain, Lacey, and Roger 1969). Flux-density measurements resulting from these surveys have been separately published (Bridle and Purton 1968; Roger, Costain, and Lacey 1969). In this paper we report 38 additional or revised flux densities at these frequencies and describe a recalibration of the flux-density scales at both frequencies. These revised flux densities are combined with selected measurements at higher frequencies to construct the spectra of 225 nonthermal radio sources below 2 GHz.

The flux-density scales used by other low-frequency observers, namely the group at the Ukrainian Academy of Sciences at Grakovo and at the University of Maryland's Clark Lake Radio Observatory are compared with ours, but in the construction of the spectra we have deliberately used only our own measurements below 38 MHz since these are the only ones we can defend for individual sources. The flux-density scales of the higher frequency measurements, particularly in the range 38-178 MHz, also require careful evaluation. Large correction factors to the scales used by Conway, Kellermann, and Long (1963) have been proposed (e.g., Scott and Shakeshaft 1971) and in the next two sections we derive scale conversion factors which we consider are mutually consistent from 10 to 178 MHz.

In the other sections we describe individual source spectra, analyze those of three complete samples of sources, and compare the spectra of specific groups of extragalactic sources.

#### II. THE LOW-FREQUENCY FLUX DENSITIES

### A. The 22-MHz Scale

The 22-MHz flux densities are measured with respect to a flux density for Cygnus A of 29 100 f.u. (1 f.u.  $= 10^{-26}$  Wm<sup>-2</sup> Hz<sup>-1</sup>) (Roger, Costain, and Lacey 1969, hereafter referred to as RCL). There is now general agreement on the flux density of this source in the range 20-40 MHz (Parker 1968; Braude, Lebedeva, Megn, Ryabov, and Zhouck 1969). Recently Viner (1971)

at the Clark Lake Radio Observatory has obtained an absolute measurement of the flux density of Cygnus A at 26.3 MHz. Using a method based on that of Little (1958), he obtains a value of 28  $700 \pm 1500$  f.u., in good agreement with the value assumed above.

The previous scaling of all weaker sources to the flux density of Cygnus A reported in RCL has been found to be in error due to the difference between the true and nominal loss of attenuators inserted in the 22-MHz array for observations of Cas A and Cyg A. The error is confirmed by independent measurements of seven intense sources (Cas A, Cyg A, Vir A, Her A, Tau A, Hyd A, and 3C 123) made with the fan beam of the E-W arm of the 22-MHz array. As a result, all flux densities listed in the RCL catalog, except those of Cas A and Cyg A, have been revised upwards by the factor 1.15. The uncertainty of the scaling with respect to Cygnus A is  $\pm 5\%$ .

Considerable care has been taken to ensure the linearity of the flux-density scale over the entire range 30-6000 f.u. (Cas A and Cyg A were attenuated to within this range). Each observation of a discrete source was accompanied by a noise temperature calibration whose magnitude was of the same order as the correlated antenna temperature due to the source. The calibration power derived from a single temperaturelimited noise diode was split and added separately through couplers to the coaxial lines feeding each arm of the T antenna to its respective preamplifier (Costain et al. 1969). The linearity of the noise power as a function of diode current was verified with precision attenuators and the output power was checked against that from another diode noise source of different manufacture. No deviations from linearity greater than  $1\%$  were detected.

Figure <sup>1</sup> shows the mean ratios of the 22-MHz flux densities to those at the same frequency interpolated from the 20 and 25-MHz measurements of the Ukrainian UTR-1 radio telescope at Grakovo (Braude et al. 1969; Braude, Lebedeva, Megn, Ryabov, and Zhouck 1970a) for various flux-density ranges. Also shown are the mean ratios of the 22-MHz flux densities to unpublished flux densities at 26.3 MHz from the Clark Lake Radio Observatory (Viner 1971). It can be seen that there is general agreement between all three scales for flux densities greater than 1000 f.u. Furthermore, the agreement between Penticton and Clark Lake scales continues down to at least 50 f.u. However, the ratio of the Grakovo to Penticton scales increases progressively to a value 1.4 at 100 f.u. This disagreement was noted by Braude, Megn, Ryabov, and Zhouck (1970b), and was used by them as a basis for revising the 22-MHz flux densities in RCL to the Grakovo scale. In view of the care taken to ensure the linearity of the 22-MHz scale and of the good agreement of the Penticton scale with the Clark Lake scale down to the 50 f.u. level, there seems to be little justification for such a revision.



Fig. 1. The mean ratios of flux densities near 22 MHz measured by the Ukrainian Academy of Sciences (Grakovo) to those used in the present study (Penticton) ; and similar ratios of U. of Maryland (Clark Lake) values to Penticton values. The latter ratios are corrected for the slight frequency difference (26.3-22 MHz). Numbers in parentheses indicate sources in each mean.

### B. SUPPLEMENTARY FLUX DENSITIES AT 22-MHZ

Twenty-five flux densities listed in Table I have been added to the revised RCL data for the determination of source spectra. Nineteen of these measurements are entirely new; the other six (marked with asterisks) replace values given in RCL. All flux densities listed in Table I incorporate the correction factor  $(\times 1.15)$ referred to in the preceding section.

### C. THE 10-MHZ SCALE

The 10-MHz flux densities used in this paper have been placed on a revised flux-density scale obtained by two methods. The first is that of Bridle and Purton (1968), henceforth referred to as BP, who adopted as a primary standard the 10.05-MHz flux density of Cas A measured on an absolute scale by Bridle (1967) at the mean epoch of their observations. BP calibrated the gain of the 10-MHz telescope at high zenith angles by adjusting the parameters of a theoretical model of the gain-zenith angle dependence to achieve agreement with the extrapolated flux densities of selected sources. We have repeated this procedure using the revised 38, 178, 750, and 1400 MHz scales (Kellermann, Pauliny-Toth, and Williams 1969, and this paper, Sec. HI). The resulting revisions to the 10-MHz calibration could be adequately represented by raising by  $25\%$  the flux densities of all sources at zenith angles greater than 15°. The second method is based directly on the revised 22-MHz scale (see Sec. HA). The spectra of twelve sources at  $|b| > 20^{\circ}$  which are not known to contain compact structure and whose spectra are well-determined power laws between 22 and 1400 MHz were extrapolated to 10.03 MHz. Comparison of the extrapolated flux densities with those of BP suggested that the latter should be raised by  $15\%$ : this correction is of the same order as the rms uncertainty due to nonlinearities in the receivers and to ionospheric effects in calibrating the observations of the weaker BP sources relative to Cas A.

Source	Flux density $10^{-26}$ Wm <sup>-2</sup> Hz <sup>-1</sup>	Comments	
3C 6.1	$71 + 10$	Background uncertain	
*3C 29	83 -20	Confusion with 4C-00.06 and 4C-01.04	
*3C 31	86 -13	Confused with 3C 34	
3C 34	69 10	Confused with 3C 31	
*3C 41	17 72	Confused with 4C 32.07	
3C 61.1	35 125	Large beam pointing uncertainty	
$3C$ 118, $(P$ 0428+01)	20 82		
$0744 + 55$ , (DA 240)	15 123	Includes $4C$ 56.16	
$4C$ 55.16, $(0831+55)$	-5 30		
3C 208	15 68	Confused with 3C 208.1	
3C 208.1	48 15	Confused with 3C 208	
3C 212	8 30		
$4C$ 31.33, $(0919+31)$	8 46	Includes 4C 31.33	
3C 227	30 205		
3C 250	20 108		
3C 273	70 410		
3C 275.1		Confused with 3C 274 sidelohes	
	46 -6		
3C 295	17 67	Confused region; other sources not cataloged.	
	(128) <b>20)</b>	(Alternative interpretation with source	
		on broad background feature)	
*P $1435+038$	90 20	Flux density assigned to MSH $14+0/10$ in RCL. Confused with $P$ 1434+03	
$*3C$ 306.1	$80^{\circ}16$	Confused with P 1452-05	
3C 313	150 25	Confused with 3C 317	
3C 317	310 -40		
3C 318.1	25 295	Confused with 3C 313 and 3C 318.1 Confused with 3C 313	
*3C 337	25 85		
		Confused with following source, possi- bly NRAO 508	
3C 445	250 - 55	Confused region	

Table I. New and revised flux densities at 22 MHz.

\* Entries replace values given in RCL.

We have therefore raised all BP flux densities, except the absolute measurements of Cas A and Cyg A, by a factor of 1.20 whose uncertainty is of order  $10\%$ . This correction is in satisfactory agreement with the absolute measurements, with the theoretical model of the antenna response, and with our adopted flux-density scale at 22, 38, 178, 750, and 1400 MHz. The correction is significantly less than that proposed by Braude et al. (1970b), who suggested revising the BP flux densities upwards by a factor  $1.66 \pm 0.25$ .

Braude et al. argued that the aperture efficiency of the 10-MHz telescope had been seriously overestimated. Their analysis, based on their estimate of the efficiency derived from two published records obtained with the instrument, appears to have overlooked two features of its operation that have beea described in the literature. The sources discussed by Braude et al. do not transit through the maxima of the fixed reception patterns available from the Butler-matrix phasing system of the  $10-MHz$  telescope (Galt et al. 1967); furthermore, a 10-sec time constant is used for the observations of strong sources, to monitor ionospheric scintillations (Bridle and Purton 1968), but a 90-sec time constant is used for studies of weaker sources. The records analyzed by Baude et al., if correctly interpreted, contain output rms noise fluctuations of  $\sim$  45 f.u., which may be compared with the maximum rms value of 60 f.u. quoted by BP. The noise level on the 10-MHz records shows appreciable variation over the sky; the

dominant noise component is contributed by the nonthermal background radiation, and is not receiver noise as suggested by Braude et al.

Braude et al. also note that the proportional uncertainties in the BP flux densities are nearly independent of flux density, and claim that this implies that BP underestimated the effects of receiver noise. They overlook the fact that the dominant uncertainties in the BP data are those introduced by the lack of repeatability of 10-MHz measurements due to changing ionospheric refraction, scintillation, scattering and absorption. These uncertainties are equally serious for sources of all flux densities.

The 10-MHz flux densities for Cas A, Cyg A, 3C 84, 3C 123,3C 144, and 3C 348, revised as described above, have been compared with those published by Clark (1966) and by Hamilton and Haynes (1968). The mean ratio of our revised 10-MHz flux densities to those of these independent workers is  $1.02 \pm 0.12$ . The source 3C 218 was excluded from this comparison because the BP observation is subject to very large ionospheric uncertainties, as noted in their paper.

We have also compared 12.6-MHz flux densities interpolated from the spectra derived in Sec. IV of this paper with those given by Braude et al. (1969). The ratio of the flux densities given by Braude et al. to our interpolated values is plotted as a function of flux density in Fig. 2. The discrepancy between the Grakovo scale and our own increases with decreasing flux density ;

1973AJ.....78.1030R

1973AJ.....78.1030R

Source	Flux density $10^{-26}$ Wm <sup>-2</sup> H <sub>z</sub> <sup>-1</sup>	Comments
4C 39.18 *4C 31.33, $(0919+31)$ 3C 238 *3C 245 3C 247 4C 21.33 3C 286 *3C 288 *3C 293 $*3C.330$ $4C_{0.5}$ 65.20 *3C 356 *3C 388	$115 + 35$ 105. -30 -55 220 170 40 35 110 145 35 25 85 -50 160 -35 170 -60 110 -35 85 30 110 -85 175	BP incorrectly identify as 3C 186 Corrected for confusion with 4C 31.34 Does not include 3C 237 BP incorrectly identify as 3C 263.1 Corrected for confusion with 4C $39.40$ and $4C.38.37$ Corrected for confusion with 4C 32.46 Corrected for confusion with 4C 65.20 Corrected for confusion with 4C 50.43 Corrected for background confusion

TABLE II. New and revised flux densities at 10 MHz.

\* Entries replace values given in BP.

the effect is similar to, but more severe than, that encountered in similar comparisons at 20 MHz (Sec. IIA of this paper), where good agreement was found between the Penticton and Clark Lake Scales. It appears that the Grakovo flux densities of weak sources are systematically overestimated in a way which becomes more pronounced as the observing frequency is decreased.

Additional evidence of this effect can be found by examining the spectra fitted to the Grakovo flux densities by Braude et al. (1970b). We consider only those sources classified by them as having power-law (i.e., straight) spectra and compare their measured flux densities (Braude et al. 1969, 1970a) at each of their observing frequencies (12.6, 14.7, 16.7, and 25 MHz) with those calculated by fitting their spectral indices to their 20-MHz flux densities. The mean ratio of the measured flux densities to the derived ones is an indication of the relative calibration at each frequency with respect to that at 20 MHz. The mean ratios and their standard errors are :



A trend which would lead to increasing overestimation of flux densitiesfrom 20 to 12.6 MHz isreadily apparent. It is emphasized that these ratios are an *underestimation* of the true effect since this discussion excludes all but power-law spectra, in particular, the large proportion of sources classified by Braude et al. (1970b) as having excess flux density at low frequencies. Flux densities at 25 MHz also appear to be overestimated with respect to those at 20 MHz.

### D. SUPPLEMENTARY ELUX DENSITIES AT 10 MHZ

Thirteen flux densities listed in Table II have been added to the revised BP data for the determination of source spectra. Four of these measurements are

entirely new; the other nine (marked with asterisks) replace the values given in BP. All flux densities listed in Table II incorporate the correction factor  $(\times 1.20)$ referred to in the preceding section.

# III. HIGHER-FREQUENCY FLUX DENSITIES

For most sources, consideration has been restricted to higher-frequency flux densities contained in recently published lists which are reasonably complete to the 3C flux-density limit. Such lists are referred to as primary data in Table III. The most comprehensive is that of Kellermann, Pauliny-Toth, and Williams (1969) (hereafter referred to as KPW) which gives flux densities at 38 and 178 MHz measured at the Mullard Observatory, Cambridge and at 750, 1400, 2695, and 5000 MHz measured at the NRAO, Green Bank.

KPW refer to the uncertainty of the flux-density scales at 38 and 178 MHz suggested by unpublished measurements of Collins at 81.5 MHz. The scales at 38 and 178 MHz are based on the CKL scale (Conway, Kellermann, and Long 1963). Scott and Shakeshaft (1971) have reported that more recent 81.5-MHz measurements are consistent with the CKL scale for



Fig. 2. The mean ratios of flux densities at 12.6 MHz measured by Grakovo Observatory to those interpolated in the present study. Numbers in parentheses indicate number of sources in each mean.

	Frequency (MHz)	<b>Revision factors</b>
Primary data		
Bridle and Purton (1968)	10.03	$1.20 \pm .10$ (S $<$ 10000 f.u.)
This paper, Table II	10.03	
Roger, Costain, and Lacey (1969)	22.25	$1.15 \pm .05$ (S $\lt$ 10000 f.u.)
This paper Table I	22.25	
Artyukh, Vitkevich, Dagkesamanskii,		
and Kazhukov (1969)	86 38	$0.94 + 03$
Kellermann, Pauliny-Toth	178	$1.18 \pm .03$ (S $<$ 550 f.u.)
and Williams (1969)	750, 1400, 2695, 5000	$1.09 \pm .03$ (S < 160 f.u.)
Bridle, Davis, Fomalont,		
and Lequeux (1972)	1400	.
Secondary data		
Williams, Kenderdine, and Baldwin		
(1966)	38	1.18
Mills, Slee, and Hill (1958)	85	.
4C Catalogues (Pilkington and Scott		
1965; Gower, Scott, and Wills 1966)	178	1.09
$4C(T)$ Catalogue (Caswell and		
Crowther 1969)	178 318	1.09
Condon (1971) Niell (1971)	430, 759, 1400	. $\cdots$
Parkes Catalogues (Shimmins and Day		
1968; Staff of Divn of Radiophysics		
1969)	408, 635, 1410, 2650	.
Bridle and Davis (1972)	<b>1400</b>	.
Wall, Shimmins, and Merkelijn (1971)	2700	.
Doherty, MacLeod, and Purton (1969)	10600	
Zimmermann (1970)	10700	$\cdots$

Table III. Data used in constructing spectra.

a few intense sources but that their flux densities less than about 300 f.u. at this frequency are in excess of the CKL scale by  $22\pm5\%$ . There is as yet no complete set of flux densities at 81.5 MHz based on the Scott and Shakeshaft scale. We have used the 86-MHz measurements by Artyukh, Vitkevich, Dagkesamanskii, and Kozhukov (1969, hereafter referred to as AVDK) as primary data. In Table IV we have compared the AVDK scale, which is based on that of Kellermann (1964), with that proposed by Scott and Shakeshaft (abbreviated to SS in the Table) after allowing for the slight frequency difference. We have also compared AVDK flux densities with those measured by Mills, Slee, and Hill (1958) (abbreviated to MSH in the Table). It is clear that there is general agreement



Fig. 3. The hierarchy of complexity used in classifying the spectra. Complexity increases<br>downwards with downwards with<br>solid, dashed, and solid, dashed, dotted lines indicating combinations of curvature which lead to a spectrum being classified as complex.

between the three scales and that the recent work by Scott and Shakeshaft confirms the original MSH scale based upon the absolute calibration by Little (1958).

We have compared the 38 and 178-MHz scales used by KPW and the 86-MHz scale of AVDK with flux densities interpolated using measurements at 22 MHz (the scale described in the preceding section) and 750, 1400, and 2695 MHz (from KPW). A group of 38 spectra well fitted by a power-law relationship over the entire frequency range was chosen for the comparison. Scale conversion factors derived in this way for the three frequencies are listed in column three of Table III. The error in the determination of these factors does not include the effect of the  $5\%$  uncertainty in the revision of the 22-MHz scale from that of RCL. In view of this, the deviation of the 86-MHz factor from unity is probably not significant.

These factors have been applied in our calculations of spectral indices. For calculations of the indices of sources whose high-frequency flux densities are not listed in the primary data, use has been made of secondary lists given in Table III.





### IV. THE SPECTRA

# A. Method of Classifying Spectra

We have attempted to fit each spectrum with the simplest curve consistent with the flux densities and their quoted errors; our criterion for simplicity is that of minimum curvature. In general, no trend to a more complex fit is followed unless it is required by two or more measurements. An exception is made for apparently significant trends indicated only by the flux density at the lowest frequency (10 or 22 MHz). Although flux densities observed at frequencies up to 5 and 10 GHz have been considered in assessing the reality of spectral trends, the classifications themselves refer only to the spectra below 2 GHz.

The scheme for classification is as follows :

- S Spectral index constant for  $\nu < 2$  GHz.<br>C- Second derivative negative on a plo
- Second derivative negative on a plot of  $\log S$ versus log v.
- $C+$  Second derivative positive on a plot of log S versus log v.
- $C_L$  Constant spectral index  $\nu > 200$  MHz; remainder  $C_L$  + of spectrum as above. of spectrum as above.
- $C_H$  Constant spectral index  $\nu$ <200 MHz; remainder  $C_H$ + as above. as above.
- $Cx$  Complex spectrum exhibiting both  $C-$  and  $C+$ features.

Figure 3 illustrates the hierarchy of complexity.

For a number of sources the spectrum can equally well be classified in two ways. In some such cases further information about the source, such as its structure, might provide a basis for choosing between alternative classifications. We have, however, preferred to retain both alternatives for such sources for two reasons : to indicate where such ambiguities exist in the spectral data taken by themselves, and to avoid biasing the spectral statistics toward any particular theoretical source model.

## B. Determination of Spectral Indices

We use the CKL definition of the spectral index  $\alpha$  in relating the flux density  $S$  to frequency  $\nu$ , namely,

$$
S(\nu) \propto \nu^{-\alpha(\nu)}.
$$

It should be noted that this definition produces indices opposite in sign to those of KPW. For each source, a curve is fitted to the data on a  $\log S$ -log  $\nu$  plot and the slopes of this curve are used to determine the spectral indices at six standard frequencies: 15, 30, 70, 200, 600, and 1800 MHz.

Spectra classified as S have been fitted with straight lines by the method of least squares in which each flux density is weighted inversely to the square of its quoted error. The straight portions of more complex spectra have also been fitted in this way.

For the remaining spectra, a curve was drawn through the  $\log S$ -log  $\nu$  plot by eye and the flux densities on the curve were read at the  $n$  frequencies of the primary catalogs. The curve was then reconstructed as a polynomial of degree  $n$  and the spectral indices at the six standard frequencies were determined from the derivative of this polynomial. We prefer this empirical approach to more formal curve fitting as the analytic forms of most curved spectra are unknown. Exceptions are the spectra of those sources at low galactic latitudes which show evidence of interstellar free-free absorption ; the indices given for these sources correspond to the form of the absorption cutoff imposed by a uniform medium. Similarly, the indices of sources with highbrightness temperatures, and whose spectra are consistent with a simple synchrotron self-absorption cutoff, are calculated from the analytic expression for such self-absorption. The use of a simple self-absorption fit presupposes that the source is homogeneous and for this reason is less justified than the galactic free-free absorption fit.

# C. The Table of Spectral Indices

Table V lists spectral indices for 226 sources. The source designations are given in Column 1. The symbols \* † and  $\ddagger$  designate members of statistically complete samples which are described in the next section.

Columns 2 and 3 list the galactic coordinates of each source. Column 4 gives its optical identification using the following code :

- G radio galaxies without bright nuclei, or of undetermined type.
- N, db galaxies with bright nuclei, other than Seyfert galaxies; from the list of Burbidge (1970).
- SEY Seyfert Galaxies.
- quasistellar objects.
- SNR supernova remnants.
- Axxx significant association with Abell Cluster xxx (Abell, 1958) on the Wills (1966) criterion.
- ? doubtful identification.
- Obsc obscuration present.
- $\Box$ blank field on Palomar Sky Survey prints, no obscuration.

Column 5 lists the spectral classification of the source as described in the preceding section. Alternative classifications are given in the order of increasing complexity unless the more complex classification was supported by a trend involving three or more data points. Marginal alternatives are bracketed. An element of subjectivity is inevitable in deciding on classification order and bracketing in marginal cases. Columns 6-11 give the spectral indices corresponding to that classification at the six standard frequencies. In general, the second decimal place in a spectral index is significant only for the  $S$  classifications. It has, however, been retained for most curved fits to indicate the trend



1036



ROGER, BRIDLE, AND COSTAIN

© American Astronomical Society • Provided by the NASA Astrophysics Data System

1973AJ....78.1030R



# LOW-FREQUENCY RADIO SPECTRA

1037



1038



TABLE V (continued)



LOW-FREQUENCY RADIO SPECTRA

1039



1040

ROGER, BRIDLE, AND COSTAIN

1973AJ....78.1030R

TABLE V (Continued)

# Notes to TABLE V (continued)

- 3C 298 The synchrontron self-absorption fit applies to the higher frequency component.
- 4C 38.39 The listed fit is to  $S_{10}$ ,  $S_{38}$ ,  $S_{178}$ , and  $S_{1417}$  from Olsen (1967). In the latter two measurements, the source may be partially resolved.
- 1435+03 Confused with a smaller source,  $1434+03$  at 22 MHz. The listed fit is to  $S_{22}$ ,  $S_{1400}$  (BD), and  $\mathrm{S}_{2700}$  (Wall, Shimmins, and Merkelijn (1435 $+$ 038).
- 1602+44 This source includes 4C 44.27 which comprises 75% of flux density at 1400 MHz (BD). The fisted fit is to  $S_{10}$ ,  $S_{38}$ , and  $S_{1400}$  (total).
- 3C 334 All low-frequency measurements may be affected by complexity of the galactic background in the neighborhood.

apparent in the  $\log S$ -log  $\nu$  plot. Where the index is changing rapidly and the retention of the second decimal place would seriously misrepresent the accuracy with which the index is determined, as is the case near the maxima of absorption cutoffs, only one decimal is listed. Where 22 MHz is the lowest frequency at which measurements have been made, there is no entry in the 15-MHz column. Similarly, where flux densities at higher frequencies are not available, the corresponding indices are absent.

Column 12 contains comments relating to the type of fit, the deviations of specific flux densities from that fit and trends in the spectrum at frequencies above 2 GHz. The abbreviations FFA and SSA indicate the probable presence of interstellar free-free absorption or synchrotron self-absorption, respectively. In such cases the parameters of these analytic fits to the spectra are listed in terms of the optical depth,  $\tau$ , at 20 MHz (FFA) or the frequency of maximum flux density,  $\nu_m$  (SSA). Column 13 indicates notes following the Table which apply to that source. Specific notes on individual sources are denoted by the symbol O.

# V. SPECTRA OF THREE COMPLETE SAMPLES OF EXTRAGALACTIC SOURCES

#### A. Choice of the Samples

Three samples of sources have been selected from those listed in Table V for study of their classification



- 4C 48.45 The listed fit is to  $S_{10}$ ,  $S_{28}$ , and  $S_{178}$ .
- 3C 399.1 It is difficult to assess how much of the low-frequency curvature in this spectrum is due to freefree absorption.
- 3C 405 The fisted fit is to the same high-frequency data as used by KPW.
- CygnusLoop Flux densities at 178 MHz and 960 MHz from Howard and Maran (1965) and at 38 MHz from Kenderdine (1963).

and spectral properties. The samples are chosen to be essentially complete to given flux-density limits at each of the frequencies 10, 178, and 1400 MHz.

The need to consider complete samples when discussing statistical properties of sources has been stressed by several authors (Williams and Bridle 1967; Kellermann, Pauliny-Toth, and Davis 1968; van der Laan 1969). It is well understood that the choice of observing frequency biases the content of samples complete to any given flux-density limit; the sources listed in Table V are indeed only those with sufficient emission to be observed at long wavelengths.

The 10-MHz sample is selected from the survey data of Bridle and Purton (1968) and contains 30 sources in a region of sky bounded by  $20^{\circ} < \delta < 60^{\circ}$ ,  $0<sup>h</sup> < \alpha < 16<sup>h</sup>30<sup>m</sup>$ , and  $|b| > 15<sup>o</sup>$ . The sample is complete to a (revised) 10-MHz flux density of 180 f.u. (Sec. II-C). Members of the sample are denoted by the symbol f in Table V, Column 1.

The 178-MHz sample has been selected from the Revised 3C Catalogue (Bennett 1962) with flux densities revised as noted in Sec. III. It contains <sup>75</sup> sources in the region  $\delta$ > -5°,  $|b|$ >15° whose revised 178-MHz flux densities exceed 18.5 f.u. The source DA 240 (Galt and Kennedy 1968, Bridle, Davis, Fomalont, and Lequeux 1972a) has been added and the galactic source 3C 363.1 has been excluded. Members of this sample are denoted by \* in Column <sup>1</sup> of Table V.

Source	$\mathbf{Id}$	Spectral class	$\alpha_{70}$	$\alpha_{200}$	$\alpha_{600}$	$\alpha_{1800}$
3C 48	$\frac{0}{\Box}$	$_{\rm c-}$	0.1	0.47	0.69	0.83
CTA 21 $(0316+16)$		$_{\rm c-}$		$-0.4$	$-0.1$	0.55
3C 272.1 [M84]	G	$S_{Cx}$		0.63		
$4C$ 32.44 $(1324 + 32)$			0.8	0.0	0.2	0.46
3C 287	o G	$C -$	$(-0.2)$	0.3	0.52	0.58
$4C$ 12.50 $(1345+12)$		$C-$		$-0.9$	0.1	0.44
$4C$ 62.22 $(1357+62)$				$-0.6$	$-0.2$	0.4
$4C$ 10.39, P1414+11	G	$C_{C}$ $C_{C}$ $C_{C}$	0.57	0.51	0.51	0.69
$P$ 0418 + 04.7				$-1.0$	$-0.5$	0.62
CTD 93 $(1607+26)$					$-0.8$	0.64
3C 343			(0.0)	0.2	0.54	0.91
3C 343.1			(0.1)	0.3	0.54	1.00
3C 345		Cx		0.2	0.33	0.31
CTA $102(2229+11)$		$C -$		$-0.1$	0.1	0.31
3C 454.3		$C +$	0.35	0.29	0.23	0.06

TABLE VI. Spectral indices of sources in the high-frequency samples.

# LOW-FREQUENCY RADIO SPECTRA 1049





 $\equiv$ 

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5) Spectral components	(6)	(7)
					MHz	
Source	Spectrum	Class	Index	$\nu_{\mathbf{m}}$	$\nu_{\rm eq}$	Structural information
		S	$\leq 1.1$	$\ddotsc$		M. Branson et al. (1972)-Maps at 1.4, 2.7,
3C 293	${}^{1}Cx$	$C -$	.	$<$ 400	100-500	and 5 GHz show main component, faint outer components and separate preceding compo- nent. Outer component may provide low fre- quency excess. F1, F2-Displaced core/halo. Spectral components poorly defined.
		S	1.7			BB—IPS indicates $70\%$ of source within 0.8
3C 298	${}^{1}Cx$	$C_{L}$ -	1.10	100	60	diameter at 80 MHz. Fit consistent with this being $C_{L}$ - component. Anderson and Donaldson (1967)—Double, components $0.5$ separated by 1.2. HH-IPS $50\%$ .
	Сx	$C_{L}$ -	1.8	29	180	MKN—Map shows a double source with per- haps a bridge and outlying emission.
3C 334		$C -$	(0.5)	150		B-Wide double with equal components ac- counts for 40% of flux density. HH-IPS $<$ 20%. Fitted components do not correspond to double structure given by MKN.
		$C_{L}$ -	0.90	19		B—single guassian source 2".1 diameter.
3C 380	Сx	(S)	0.15	.	2400	Donaldson et al. (1969)—At 1420 MHz $43\%$ is <0.710; at 2690 MHz 50% <0.7025. Clark et al. (1968)-50% <0.03 at 1660 MHz.
		S	1.4	.		MKN—Map shows complex region.
3C 402	Сx	$C-$	.	$<$ 100	130	Fit to total spectrum indicates $\geq 70\%$ of flux density near 20 MHz comes from most north- erly component of MKN (cf RCL).
		$C_{L}$ -	1.4	$\leq$ 15	25	MKN—Map shows two peaks and surround- ing emission.
3C 430	Сx	$C_{L}$ -	0.68	$\leq$ 15		F1-Diameter $\sim$ 40" EW. Low-frequency component possibly associated with outlying emission. Turnover possibly due to interstellar free- free absorption $(b=8^{\circ})$ .
		S	1.4	.		L—Map at 80 MHz shows source $\sim$ (12'
3C 445	$C+$				40	$\times$ 5') at p.a. 150 $^{\circ}$ .
		S	0.70	.		F1-Double with components 40" separated $1′$ EW.
		S	1.3			B—Double, unresolved components 15" apart,
3C 446 $\sim 100$	$C+$	S	0.35	.	80	flux density ratio $16:1$ . Donaldson et al. (1971)—Core/halo; core $<$ 0".04, halo 0".4 EW $\times$ 0".2 NS. Clark et al. (1968)-50% flux density in com- $ponent < 0.04$ . Clarke et al. (1969)-diameter 0".034 at 430 MHz.
		S	$\leq 2.0$	$\cdots$		$F1$ —Unresolved, $\lt 15$ ''.
3C 454.2	$C+$	(S)	0.75	.	50	High-frequency component may be curved $(C-).$

TABLE XIV (continued)

Notes to TABLE XIV.

1 Indicates spectrum classification is not the primary one for this source in Table V.

Abbreviations used in Column 7.

- 
- A Allen *et al.* (1962) 158 MHz 2200λ–6100λ interferometer.<br>B Bash (1968) 2695 MHz. 10000λ–24000λ interferometer.<br>BB Burnell (1972) IPS 81.5 MHz.
- 
- 
- 
- BC Bridle and Costain (in preparation).<br>CH Clark and Hogg (1966) 2695 MHz 21500X interferometer.<br>F1 Fomalont (1968) 1425 MHz. 144X–2626X east-west inter-

ferometer.

F2 Fomalont (1971) 1425 MHz. 144λ-2626λ E-W, N-S interferometer.

- HH Harris and Hardeback (1969) IPS. 430 MHz.
- L Lockhart (1971) 80 MHz 3.'8 pencil beam.<br>LH Little and Hewish (1968) IPS. 178 MHz.
- LH Little and Hewish (1968) IPS. 178 MHz.<br>M Mackay (1969) 408 MHz. 1407 MHz. Res
- M Mackay (1969) 408 MHz. 1407 MHz. Resolution 20".
- MKN Macdonald et al. (1968) 408 MHz, 1407 MHz. Resolution 20".
- RCL Roger et al. (1969).

# © American Astronomical Society • Provided by the NASA Astrophysics Data System



FIG. 6 (a-b). The spectra of radio sources with some evidence of positive curvature. Dashed lines indicate possible spectral components which could account for the observed total spectrum. The reality of these components i

and 5% levels of confidence for coefficients of 0.42 and 0.33, respectively. The correlation between luminosity and spectral index is therefore statistically significant, whereas those between emissivity and index or volume and index are not.

It is necessary to consider whether or not the correlations of emissivity and volume with spectral index could appear insignificant simply because of uncertainties in the angular sizes used to calculate these parameters. To test this, angular sizes for 14 sources given both by Fomalont (1968) and by Macdonald et al. (1968) were used separately to calculate emissivity and volume. The rms difference between the corresponding pairs of values permits estimation of the intrinsic dispersion in these parameters. If there were a high correlation between emissivity (or volume) and spectral index, the intrinsic dispersion is sufficient to reduce any correlation coefficient between luminosity and spectral index to less than about 0.3. Since this is much lower than the value actually calculated we must conclude that the luminosity-spectral index relation is the significant one.

Inclusion of the spectral indices of the N and db galaxies does not significantly alter the correlations. The QSS are in two groupings, the most numerous having average volume and high emissivity and the

030<sub>R</sub> 00r" 73AJ LOW-FREQUENCY RADIO SPECTRA 1053





other with large volume and less than average emissivity. All have high luminosity. The median spectral index for the transparent QSS is 0.98, considerably in excess of the median for ordinary radio galaxies.

Bridle et al. noted that the distribution of luminosities in their sample is determined almost entirely by the distribution of redshifts (or apparent magnitudes) since the range in flux density for the sample is small. This is equally true with the present galaxy sample; if one correlates spectral index with apparent magnitude, the correlation coefficient is virtually the same as that between index and luminosity. In this context it is of interest to consider the distribution of transparent spectral indices for sources in blank fields. If, as is often assumed, these sources are mostly radio galaxies at great distances, then they will be sources of high-radio luminosity and should have a distribution of spectral indices consistent with the derived trend. Figure 5 shows the spectral-index distributions for the blank field sources, for radio galaxies with apparent magnitudes greater and less than 17.5 and for the QSS. The distribution for blank field sources least resembles that of the QSS and a  $\chi^2$  test indicates less than  $1\%$ probability that the blank field sources are a random selection from a population whose spectral indices are distributed like those of the QSS. A similar test reveals



Fig. 7. Distribution of the spectral indices at 200 MHz for radio sources at galactic latitudes  $|b| < 15^{\circ}$ . The shaded areas represent (a) supernova remnants and (b) optically obscured sources.

less than a  $5\%$  chance that the blank fields are entirely a random selection from the population of optically faint radio galaxies. The blank fields are therefore unlikely, from the evidence of their spectra, to contain many quasistellar objects, but are also unlikely to be entirely high-luminosity radio galaxies. Indeed, the spectral data of these small samples would suggest that the blank fields are most similar to the radio galaxies as a whole (i.e., both high- and low-luminosity).

# B. Multicomponent Sources

Sources exhibiting some positive curvature in their total spectra are classified as  $C+$ ,  $C<sub>L</sub>+$ , and  $Cx$  in Table V. In most cases these are likely to have two or more distinct components with significantly different spectral properties.

Table XIV contains an analysis of these spectra. In each case the spectrum below 2 GHz has been split into two (occasionally three) plausible components each with a spectral class as indicated in Column three. Here the classification  $C_L$ — and  $C_H$ — refer to curvature confined to the low or high frequency extreme appropriate for the source components only. Column 4 lists the spectral index for power-law sections of the component spectra. Column 5 gives the frequencies of maximum flux density for components showing turnovers. Column 6 is a list of the frequencies at which

the proposed components contribute equally to the flux density. Structure revealed by high-resolution pencil-beam and interferometer studies of these sources and by interplanetary scintillation observations which may relate to the identification of the spectral components are noted in Column 7. The total spectra and the suggested components are illustrated in Fig. 6. It must be emphasized that in proposing these "plausible components" we do not wish, unless there is supporting evidence, to imply that the separation proposed is unique. The table is intended to draw attention to the possible range of complexity of the low-frequency spectra.

There are several difficulties which hinder attempts to associate spectral components with structure revealed by higher frequency measurements of high resolution. First, it is easily shown, that, even under favorable conditions, two power-law spectral components must have indices differing by at least 0.3 before curvature in the total spectrum is detectable with present day measurement errors (Bridle 1969). An example of such a spectrum is that of 3C 78 in which the complex fit shown in Fig. 6 is listed as a second preference in Table V. A second difficulty is that components with high spectral indices which produce excess flux density at low frequencies are often too weak or of too low surface brightness to appear in high-resolution maps at shorter wavelengths (e.g., 3C 66). Only greatly improved resolution at long wavelengths or sensitivity at short wavelengths can be expected to reveal details of such structure. The low resolution of the low-frequency observations also makes it difficult to rule out the possibility that excess flux density apparent in a total spectrum is due to a physically unrelated (confusing) source (e.g., 3C 75). The presence of nearby small-diameter sources can often be checked by reference to high-sensitivity surveys at higher frequencies, but large diameter features partially or completely resolved by these surveys present a problem.

In many radio sources in Table XIV structure covering a wide range of angular diameters has been measured. The steeper spectrum low-frequency components are usually associated with the more extended emission or halos. 3C 40, 3C 66, 3C 247, 3C 265, 3C 273, 3C 286, and 3C 430 are examples of this. In some cases the association is merely one of default, because the flatter spectral component (if there are two) which becomes optically thick and disappears at long wavelengths most likely corresponds to the structure of small angular size if self-absorption is operative. Nevertheless, some radio sources do appear to have extended components with high-spectral indices; such components may represent fossil remnants of powerful initial outbursts in which E 2 losses (e.g., synchrotron losses, inverse Compton losses) or differential diffusion have preferentially depleted the higher energy electrons.

### C. The Spectra of Sources at Low Galactic Latitudes

The spectra of radio sources close to the galactic plane require separate consideration for several reasons; firstly, because any sample at low latitudes will contain galactic sources, supernova remnants (SNR) in particular, and secondly, because at low frequencies the effects of free-free absorption by interstellar ionization can be expected. Furthermore, obscuration precludes optical identification of many sources at low latitudes.

Of the 47 sources listed in Table V for which  $|b| < 15^{\circ}$ , 13 are obscured. Six sources are identified with SNR's. The remaining 18 identified sources contain radio galaxies and QSS's in a proportion similar to that found at higher latitudes. The distribution of the spectral indices at 200 MHz for the 47 sources is shown in Fig. 7, with shading to indicate the indices of the SNR's and obscured sources. It can be seen that whereas the SNR's have distinctly flatter spectra on average, the obscured sources have indices evenly displaced about the median. Hence, purely on grounds of spectral index one would suspect that the obscured sources are mostly extragalactic.

The 41 sources other than the SNR's have only  $30\%$ of their spectra classified as straight compared to  $41\%$ for samples of sources with  $|b|>15^{\circ}$ : the difference is made up by spectra with negative curvature, probably due to free-free absorption. In all, 19 of the low-latitude sources have spectral curvature at low frequencies which might be attributed to interstellar absorption. These are indicated as FFA in Column 12 of Table V together with an estimate of optical depth implied by a fit to the spectral curvature. The effect is apparent on slightly more than half the sources at  $|b| \leq 5^{\circ}$  and on about one-third of those with range  $5^{\circ}$  <  $|b|$  < 15°.

## VII. CONCLUSIONS

We have considered radio source spectra extended by new measurements at the lowest available frequencies. In interpreting the spectral properties of radio sources, it is essential to consider separately the range of the spectrum displaying negative curvature and that showing a power-law variation. Only in this latter range, if the source is transparent, can the spectral index reflect the electron energy spectrum.

# A. Power-law Spectra

It is now well established that radio galaxies with power-law spectra have spectral indices which correlate with the total radio luminosities of the galaxies. This effect appears to be largely independent of any evolutionary expansion of the sources. However, samples of identified sources reaching at least an order of magnitude weaker in flux density will be required to distinguish index-redshift (or index-apparent magnitude) correlation from index-luminosity correlations.

If one assumes that the redshifts of quasistellar sources indicate their distances, then these are among the most luminous of radio sources and the transparent indices are correspondingly high. It is, however, only on the basis of redshift determined distances that the majority of QSS can be classed as having high radio luminosity. Hence, whether or not the same physical process which links radio galaxy luminosity and the electron energy spectrum is also operative in QSS hinges on the interpretation of QSS redshifts.

The nature of some sources identified with blank fields is also in question since several in a small sample show power-law spectral indices characteristic of neither high-luminosity radio galaxies nor QSS. The distribution of spectral indices for the blank field sources most resembles that of radio galaxies as a whole. Spectral indices for a larger sample may clarify the nature of these blank fields.

## B. Absorption Effects in Total Spectra

The proportion of "turnover" spectra for sources at latitudes  $|b|$  < 15° is greater than that at higher latitudes. Hence the presence of interstellar absorption is statistically confirmed. However, even for latitudes  $|b|$  <5° by no means all extragalactic sources exhibit spectral curvature at 20 MHz.

At higher latitudes a large fraction of radio sources with unusually low spectral indices are known from interplanetary scintillation measurements to have compact structure. Conversely, most sources which exhibit IPS have spectral curvature at low frequencies. QSS comprise a large proportion of both groups. Amongst the scintillators the spectral curvature is more pronounced the greater the degree of scintillation and is likely due to synchrotron self-absorption. The spectral class  $C_L$ — contains a large proportion of QSS and it is probably for this reason that the median index for the class is higher than that of the  $S$  class. On the other hand, the nonscintillators are mostly radio galaxies and power-law spectra predominate. One can conclude, then, that the division of radio sources into radio galaxies and QSS is supported to some extent by their radio spectra.

It is noteworthy that few sources with self-absorption curvature have spectra with well-measured opaque portions of index near  $-2.5$  such as that measured for PKS 1934-63 (Kellermann 1966b). There are probably two reasons for this. First, such a total spectrum will occur only when the source has a well-defined boundary and contains no other lower frequency components. Second, even when this condition is met, with present day measurements at discrete well-spaced frequencies, there is a good chance that the flux density may be measured easily near the turnover frequency but lie below the sensitivity limit at the next lower discrete frequency. 3C 275.1 is an example of this.

	$20$ MHz Flux density		Power-law Range		
Source	$10^{-26} W m^{-2} Hz^{-1}$	Spectral index	Lower	Upper	
3C 33	290	0.72	$10$ MHz	6 GHz	
3C 161	210	0.67	20		
3C 196.1	250	1.16	20		
3C 205	90	0.88	10		
3C 218	2450	0.97	20		
3C 270	230	0.61	20		
3C 274	6150	0.80	10		
3C 280	135	0.80	10		
3C 348	3350	1.01	10		
3C 353	1230	0.73	10		

TABLE XV. Suggested calibration sources.

## VIII. CALIBRATION SOURCES FOR FUTURE MEASUREMENTS

Because of differences in the flux density scales discussed in Sec. II, only half of the 161 sources considered, both in the present study and in that of Braude et al. (1970b) are classified in the same way. As one might expect, the discrepancies are predominantly in the sense that Braude et al. find a larger proportion of radio sources with positive curvature in their spectra and fewer with negative curvature. Individual differences are too numerous to cite.

In general, agreement of the two scales is confined to sources stronger than 1000 f.u. near 20 MHz. In particular, however, there are a number of weaker sources whose spectra even to 10 MHz agree in the two studies. Table XV contains a list of ten sources, all with power-law spectra at low frequencies for which there is good agreement both in flux density and in spectral index. We suggest that these be included as calibration sources in future observations.

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are indebted to Dr. W. C. Erikson, Dr. M. Viner, Professor S. Ya. Braude, Dr. J. R. Shakeshaft, Dr. A. Niell, and Dr. J. J. Condon for providing us with their measurements prior to publication.

#### REFERENCES

- Abell, G. O. (1958). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 3, 211.
- Men, L. R., Anderson, B., Conway, R. G., and Palmer, H. P. (1962). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 124,477.
- Anderson, B., and Donaldson, W. (1967). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 137, 81.
- Andrew, B. H. (1967). Astrophys. J. 147, 423.
- Artyukh, V. S., Vitkevich, V. V., Dagkesamanskii, R. D., and Kozhukhov, V. N. (1969). Sov. Astron.-AJ 12,567.
- Bash, F. N. (1968). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 16, 373.
- Bennett, A. S. (1962). Mem. R. Astron. Soc. 68, 163.
- Bozyan, E. P. (1968). Astrophys. J. 157, L77.
- Branson, N. J. B. A., Elsmore, B., Pooley, G. G., Ryle, M. (1972). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 156, 377.
- Braude, S. Ya., Lebedeva, O. M., Megn, A. V., Ryabov, B. P., and Zhouck, I. N. (1969). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 143, 289.

Braude, S. Ya., Lebedeva, P. M., Megn, A. V., Ryabov, B. P., and Zhouck, I. N. (1970a). Astrophys. Lett. 5, 129.

- Braude, S. Ya., Megn, A. V., Ryabov, B. P., and Zhouck, I. N. (1970b). Astrophys. Space Sei. 8, 275.
- Bridle, A. H., and Purton, C. R. (1968). Astron. J. 73,717.
- Bridle, A. H. (1967). Observatory 87, 60.
- Bridle, A. H. (1968). J. Roy. Astron. Soc. Canada 62, 193.
- Bridie, A. H. (1969). Nature (Lond.) 224, 889.
- Bridle, A. H., and Costain, C. H. (1970). J. Roy. Astron. Soc. Canada 64, 184.
- Bridle, A. H., and Davis, M. M. (1973). Personal Communication.
- Bridle, A. H., Davis, M. M., Fomalont, E. B., and Lequeux, J. (1972). Astron. J. 77, 405.
- Bridle, A. H., and Feldman, P. A. (1972). Nat. Phys. Sei. 235, 168.
- Bridle, A. H., Kesteven, M. J. L., and Guindon, B. (1972). Astrophys. Lett. 11, 27.
- Burnell, S. J. (1972). Astron. Astrophys. 16, 379.
- Caswell, J. L., and Crowther, J. H. (1969). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 145, 181.
- Caswell, J. L., Crowther, J. H., and Holden, D. J. (1967). Mem. R. Astron. Soc. 72, 1.
- Clark, B. G., and Hogg, D. E. (1966). Astrophys. J. 145, 21.
- Clark, B. G., Kellermann, K. I., Bare, C. C, Cohen, M. H., and Jauncey, D. L. (1968). Astrophys. J. 153, 705.
- Clark, T. A. (1966). Astron. J. 71, 158(A).
- Clarke, R. W., Broten, N. W., Legg, T. H., Locke, J. L., and
	- Yen, J. L. (1969). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 146, 381.
- Condon, J. J. (1971). Personal communication.
- Conway, R. G., Kellermann, K. I., and Long, R. J. (1963). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 125, 261.
- Costain, C. H., Bridle, A. H., and Feldman, P. A. (1972). Astrophys. J. 175, LI5.
- Costain, C. H., Lacey, J. D., and Roger, R. S. (1969). IEEE Trans. Antennas Propag. AP-17, 162.
- Cronyn, W. M. (1970). Science 168, 1453.
- Doherty, L. H., MacLeod, J. M., and Purton, C. R. (1969). Astron. J. 74, 827.
- Donaldson, W., Miley, G. K., Palmer, H. P., and Smith, H. (1971). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 146, 213.
- Ekers, R. D. (1965). Aust. J. Phys. Astrophys. Suppl. No. 6.
- Ellis, G. R. A., and Hamilton, P. A. (1966). Astrophys. J. 143, 227.
- Elsmore, B., and Mackay, C. D..(1969). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 145, 361.
- Fomalont, E. B. (1968). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 15, 203.
- Fomalont, E. B. (1971). Astron. J. 76, 513.
- Galt, J. A., and Kennedy, J. E. D. (1968). Astron. J. 73, 135.
- Galt, J. A., Purton, C. R., and Scheuer, P. A. G. (1967). Publ. Dom. Obs. Can. 25,295.
- Gower, J. F. R., Scott, P. F., and Wills, D. (1967). Mem. R. Astron. Soc. 71, 49.
- Hamilton, P. A., and Haynes, R. F. (1968). Aust. J. Phys. 21, 895.
	- Harris, D. E., and Hardebeck, E. G. (1969). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 19, 115.
	- Hazard, C., Gulkis, S., and Bray, A. D. (1966). Nature (Lond.) 212, 461.
	- Heeschen, D. S. (1960). Publ. Astron. Soc. Pac. 72, 368.
	- Howard, W. E., and Maran, S. P. (1965). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 10, 1.
	- Kellermann, K. I. (1964). Astrophys. J. 140, 969.
	- Kellerman, K. I. (1966a). Astrophys. J. 148, 621.
	- Kellerman, K. I. (1966b). Aust. J. Phys. 19,195.
	- Kellermann, K. I. (1966b). 19, 195. .
	- Kellermann, K. I., and Pauliny-Toth, I. I. K. (1971). Astrophys. Lett. 8, 153.
	- Kellermann, K. I., Pauliny-Toth, I. I. K., and Williams, P. J. S. (1969). Astrophys. J. 157, 1.
	- Kenderdine, S. (1963). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 126, 55.
	- Little, A. G. (1958). Aust. J. Phys. 11,70.
	- Little, L. T., and Hewish, A. (1966). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 134, 221.
	- Lockhart, I. (1971). Ph.D. thesis, Australian National University, Canberra.
	- Macdonald, G. H., Kenderdine, S., and Neville, A. C. (1968). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 138, 259.
	- Mackay, C. D. (1969). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 145, 31.
	- MacLeod, J. M., and Doherty, L. H. (1972). Nature (Lond.) 238, 89.
	- Mills, B. Y., Slee, O. B., and Hill, E. R. (1958). Aust. J. Phys. 11, 360.
	- Mitton, S. (1970). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 149, 101.
	- Moffet, A. T., Schmidt, M., Slater, C. H., and Thompson, A. R. (1967). Astrophys. J. 148, 283.
	- Munro, R. E. B. (1971). Aust. J. Phys. 24, 743.
	- Niell, A. (1971). Personal communication.
	- Olsen, E. T. (1967). Astron. J. 72, 738.
- Parker, E. A. (1968). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 138, 407. Pauliny-Toth, I. I. K., Wade, C. M., and Heeschen, D. S.
- (1966). Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser. 13, 65.
- Pilkington, J. D. H., and Scott, P. F. (1965). Mem. R. Astron. Soc. 69, 183.
- Roub, G. (1969). Publ. Univ. Bologna, Contrib. 55.
- Ryle, M. and Longair, M. S. (1967). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 136, 123.
- Ryle, M., and Windram, M. D. (1968). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 138, 1.
- Scott, P. F., and Shakeshaft, J. R. (1971). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 154, 198.
- Scheer, D. J., and Kraus, J. D. (1967). Astron. J. 72, 536.
- Schilizzi, R. T, Lockhardt, I. A., and Wall, J. V. (1972). Aust. J. Phys. 25, 545.
- Shimmins, A. J., and Day, G. A. (1968). Aust. J. Phys. 21, 377.
- Shlovskii, I, S. (1960). Sov. Astron.-AJ 4, 243.
- Slee, O. B. and Wraith, P. K. (1967). Nature (Lond.) 214, 971.
- Smith, M. A. (1968). Ph.D. thesis, University of Cambridge. Staff of Radiophysics Division, CSIRO, (1969). Aust. J. Phys. Astrophys. Suppl. 7.
- van der Laan, H. (1969). Astron. Astrophys. 3, 477.
- Véron, M. P., Véron, P., and Witzel, A. (1972). Astron. Astrophys. 18, 82.
- Viner, M. (1971). personal communication.
- Wall J. V., Shimmins, A. J., and Merkelijn, J. K. (1971). Aust. J. Phys. Astrophys. Suppl. 19.
- Williams, P. J. S., and Bridle, A. H. (1967). Observatory 87, 280.
- Williams, P. J. S., Kenderdine, S., and Baldwin, J. E. (1966). Mem. R. Astron. Soc. 70, 53.
- Wills, D. (1966). Observatory 86, 140.
- Willson, M. A. G. (1970). Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 151, 1.
- Zimmermann, P. (1970). Beiträge zur Radioastronomie I, 161.